

Remarks/Arguments

Claim Summary

By this Amendment, claim 13 has been amended to incorporate the subject matter of claim 18, and claims 18 and 19 have been cancelled.

Claims 13-16 and 21 are now pending in the application.

35 USC 103

Claims 13-16, 18, 19 and 21 were rejected under 35 USC 103 as being unpatentable over Miyashita et al. (US 6354913) in view of Deal et al. (US 5139571). Applicants respectfully traverse this rejection with respect to the now-pending claims 13-16 and 21.

In the Office Action, the Examiner states:

“Miyashita further differs in failing to teach a choline derivative, in claim 13, 18 and 19. Deal discloses choline (same as Applicants’ choline derivative) is used in a wafer polishing slurry ...”

Applicants acknowledge that Deal et al. discloses the use of choline. See, for example, FIG. 4 and column 3, line 51, through column 4, line 8, of Deal et al. However, Applicants can find no teaching or suggestion in Deal et al. of the use of choline chloride as recited in amended independent claim 13 (previously recited in dependent claim 18).

For at least the reasons stated above, Applicants respectfully contend that claims 13-16 and 21 would not have been obvious to one of ordinary skill in view of the teachings of Miyashita et al. and Deal et al.

Conclusion

No other issues remaining, reconsideration and favorable action upon the elected claims 13-16 and 21 now present in the application are requested.

Respectfully submitted,

VOLENTINE FRANCOS & WHITT, PLLC

By:



Adam C. Volentine
Reg. No. 33,289

Date: August 7, 2006

Customer Number 20987
Volentine Francos & Whitt, PLLC
11951 Freedom Drive, Suite 1260
Reston VA 20190
Tel. 571.283.0720